

Approved by the Charlotte-
Mecklenburg Board of Education
January 12, 2010
Regular Board Meeting



Charlotte, North Carolina

December 8, 2009

**REGULAR MEETING
of the
CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG BOARD OF EDUCATION**

The Charlotte-Mecklenburg Board of Education held a Regular Board Meeting on December 8, 2009. The meeting began at 5:53 p.m. and was held in Room CH-14 of the Government Center.

Present: Kaye Bernard McGarry, Vice-Chairperson, Member At-Large;
Trent Merchant, Member At-Large;
Joe I. White, Jr., Member At-Large;
Rhonda Lennon (District 1);
Richard Allen McElrath, Sr. (District 2);
Dr. Joyce Davis Waddell (District 3);
Tom Tate (District 4);
Eric C. Davis (District 5); and
Timothy S. Morgan (District 6)

Absent: There were no absences.

Also present at the request of the Board were Dr. Peter Gorman, Superintendent; André F. Mayes, Acting General Counsel/Deputy General Counsel; Hugh Hattabaugh, Chief Operating Officer; Mike Raible, Executive Director for Planning and Project Management; and Nancy Daughtridge, Clerk to the Board.

Upon motion by Mr. White, seconded by Mr. Merchant, the Board voted unanimously of those present for approval to go into Closed Session for the following purpose:

- **To consider student assignment matters that is privileged, confidential and not a public record**

The motion was made pursuant to Section 143-318.11(a) of the North Carolina General Statutes and the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act.

The Board held an Installation Ceremony from 5:00 p.m. to 5:40 p.m. in the Meeting Chamber and a Closed Session meeting from 5:53 p.m. to 5:58 p.m. in CH-14.

Vice-Chairperson McGarry reconvened the Regular Board Meeting at 6:07 p.m. in the Meeting Chamber of the Government Center. CMS-TV Channel 3 televised the meeting.

Present: Kaye Bernard McGarry, Vice-Chairperson, Member At-Large;
Trent Merchant, Member At-Large;
Joe I. White, Jr., Member At-Large;
Rhonda Lennon (District 1);

Richard Allen McElrath, Sr. (District 2);
Dr. Joyce Davis Waddell (District 3);
Tom Tate (District 4);
Eric C. Davis (District 5); and
Timothy S. Morgan (District 6)

Absent: There were no absences.

Also present at the request of the Board were Dr. Peter Gorman, Superintendent; André F. Mayes, Acting General Counsel/Deputy General Counsel; Members of Executive and Senior Staffs; Judy Whittington, Manager of Board Services; and Nancy Daughtridge, Clerk to the Board.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Vice-Chairperson McGarry called the meeting to order at 6:07 p.m. Vice-Chairperson McGarry welcomed everyone to the Board's first meeting of the month.

A. Pledge of Allegiance

Vice Chairperson McGarry introduced the student to lead those present and in the viewing audience in the Pledge of Allegiance and to speak to the December character trait of "caring." Tranice Warner is an eighth grade student at Albemarle Road Middle School. Interesting facts about Tranice include she is a straight A student; a proud recipient of the Duke TIP Scholarship; named a nominee for the National Congressional Young Leaders Conference; member of the volleyball team, and she plans to tryout for cheerleader and track this year. Before coming to Charlotte-Mecklenburg Schools from Missouri, she participated in the CHALLENGE course of study which exposed her to high school curriculum in Spanish I and II, World History, Biology, Physics, ACT/SAT Prep, U.S. History, Junior English, and Latin. She scored 29 on the ACT test and 1432 on the SAT test. Tranice is a PETA activist, organizes demonstrations for the organization, and has recruited 200 members for the next demonstration which is scheduled for December 5th at the KFC on Albemarle Road. Tranice takes pride in being a published author and plans to continue the IB Program to the East Mecklenburg High School Diploma Program. Attending the meeting with Tranice were her mother, Tahirah Warner; her sister; and her assistant principal, Tonie Perry. Tranice invited everyone to stand and join her in reciting the Pledge of Allegiance. Tranice said the character trait for December is "caring." Caring is when you think about what you do or say before you take action. It is important to consider how your actions may affect other people.

Vice-Chairperson reported that the Board held an Installation Ceremony at 5:00 p.m. and the newly elected Board members were sworn into office. Vice-Chairperson McGarry welcomed the newly installed Board members: Rhonda Lennon of District 1, Richard McElrath of District 2, Dr. Joyce Waddell of District 3, reelected Tom Tate of District 4, Eric Davis of District 5, and Timothy Morgan of District 6.

B. Adoption of Agenda

Vice-Chairperson McGarry called for a motion for the adoption of the agenda which

included the deletion of Action Item IV. B. (Motion to name the football stadium at North Mecklenburg High School the “William A. Hough Stadium” in memory of Mr. William A. Hough, former principal of North Mecklenburg High School, as requested by Kaye McGarry, Member At-large.

Mr. Tate moved, seconded by Dr. Waddell, that the Board adopt the agenda as amended, and the Board voted 9-0 in support of the motion.

C. Election of Board Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson

Vice-Chairperson McGarry called upon Dr. Gorman to conduct the election for Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson. Dr. Gorman reviewed Bylaw BDB which provides that a Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson shall be elected at the first Regular Board meeting in December and shall assume the office immediately upon election. The election of a Chairperson will proceed according to the following procedure:

- Call for nominations. The nominations will continue until every member has had the opportunity to place a name in nomination.
- Call for a motion to close the nominations.
- Following the close of the nominations and if there is more than one nomination for the seat, the votes will be called for in the order in which the nominees were nominated. The first person to receive the majority of the votes of those Board members present will be elected as the new Chairperson and will assume the office immediately.

Dr. Gorman opened the floor for nominations for Board Chairperson.

Tom Tate nominated Eric Davis.

Rhonda Lennon nominated Kaye McGarry.

Dr. Gorman called for a motion to close the nominations.

Mr. Merchant moved that the nominations be closed on the said two names for Chairperson, seconded by Mr. Morgan, and the Board voted 9-0 in support of the motion.

Dr. Gorman declared the nominations for Board Chairperson closed. Dr. Gorman conducted the election of the Board Chairperson following the order of the nominations. Dr. Gorman called for the votes for Eric Davis.

Eric Davis received an 8-0-1 Board vote. Board members Merchant, White, Lennon, McElrath, Waddell, Tate, Davis, and Morgan voted in support of Mr. Davis as Chairperson. Board member McGarry abstained.

Dr. Gorman declared Eric Davis had received the majority of the Board votes and had been elected Chairperson of the Board of Education.

Dr. Gorman called upon Chairperson Davis to conduct the election for Vice-Chairperson. Chairperson Davis called for nominations for Vice-Chairperson.

Dr. Waddell nominated Tom Tate.

Mr. Merchant moved that the nominations be closed on the said one name for Vice-Chairperson, seconded by Mr. White, and the Board voted 9-0 in support of closing the nominations.

Chairperson Davis said there were no other nominations for Vice-Chairperson and he declared Tom Tate Vice-Chairperson of the Board of Education.

II. REQUEST FROM THE PUBLIC

Chairperson Davis said this is an opportunity to hear from the public. He encouraged the audience to be mindful of showing respect to the speakers and to refrain from either showing support or displeasure. Each speaker will be given three minutes to address the Board.

Twenty-nine speakers addressed the Board on various subjects.

Twelve speakers urged the Board to rescind the Board vote regarding the changes to the IB Program at Myers Park High School. They discussed the importance of maintaining the IB Program at Myers Park; the negative impact the decision has on students; the Board should face the real boundary issues; and the decision is disrupting the path of many students and will weaken the strength of the Myers Park Program and the diversity of the school.

- Mike Vaughn, parent of students in the IB Program at Randolph Middle School.
- Nicholas Rose
- Meg Maloney
- Margo Henson
- Dr. Kumar
- Sona Kumar/Aparna Balakrishnan, IB students at Myers Park High School.
- Catherine Hare, senior and president of the IB Program at Myers Park High School.
- Jeff Hinson, parents of students at Myers Park High School.
- Kim Lamphear
- Suzan Becker, parent of students in the IB Program at Myers Park.
- Nupur Chareyalu, freshman at Myers Park High School.
- Miriam Maloney, freshman in the IB Program at Myers Park High School.

Christopher Harper, represented Talents Are Discovered Awareness (TADA) Program, which is an after school tutoring program to ensure success. He would like to work in concert with CMS and other schools to establish free tutoring programs for all children.

Five speakers expressed their concerns regarding the naming the new high school the W.A. Hough High School and urged the Board to rescind its previous vote. They discussed concerns regarding the naming process was not followed, the name may be mispronounced to cause the students to be embarrassed, parents and students were not engaged in the process, and they asked the Board to reconvene the School Naming Committee.

- Janet Wirostek.
- Dave Gilroy, Board member on the Cornelius Town Council.
- Kayli Kingery, 7th grade student at Bailey Middle School and future student of Hough High, said names do hurt and asked the Board to let the students vote.
- Ed Conway.
- David Tinkler.

Five speakers encouraged the Board to honor the Board's decision in naming the new high school the W. A. Hough High School and to honor Mr. Hough and his family.

- Jimmy Poole also addressed his concerns regarding the changes to the boundaries in the northern area because they will cause the area to lose its identity. He shared boundary recommendations for the Board's consideration.
- Natasha Marcus, parent of daughters who will attend the new high school.
- Rodney Graham.
- Bill Strong.
- Margaret Houck, 6th grade student at Amay James Middle School and future student of Hough High. We are rough and tough. We are from Hough High.

Robin Bradford encouraged the Board to address issues for all students attending all schools because achieving equity throughout CMS is important for all students. She urged the Board to keep the equity promises and to keep the new school named after Mr. Hough because his legacy should remain in District 1.

Three people encouraged the Board to implement a fair transition for the Mint Hill High School assignment plan and to develop a family friendly policy.

- Derrick Williams urged the Board to implement a three year transition plan that keeps siblings together and he noted the hardships of siblings attending different schools.
- Ms. Boon spoke on behalf of Butler High School and urged the Board to guarantee Butler an open school status. She discussed the difficulties of families with students attending different schools and transitioning to a new school. She has been told for nine years that her daughter would attend Butler and she has spent the past year getting rooted in Butler as a freshman and now she has been reassigned to Independence High School.
- Julie Parsons encouraged the Board to make decisions that make families and schools strong, to make common sense decisions; give all students not assigned to Mint Hill the option to remain at their current high school; and to rectify the burden of splitting families and let siblings remain together. She expressed concern that the Board's decision will cause college bound students to get off track and divided families will not build strong schools.

Ruth Harris represented East Mecklenburg High School and she thanked the Board for their decision regarding the IB Program. She is a product of CMS, graduated from East Mecklenburg High School, and she is active at her children's school. She supports the Board's decision. East Mecklenburg will welcome all students and staff and students look forward to the transition and will make it as seamless as possible. She encouraged the Board to keep East Mecklenburg strong.

Phil Carey is an active citizen in District 1 and he expressed concern that the motion to rescind the approval of the name of Hough High School was put on the agenda. He does not believe this was an appropriate method of handling this issue because this could result in some children believing their name is not acceptable rather than being the best they can be. He urged the Board to send a strong statement to the parents.

III. CONSENT ITEMS

- A. Recommend approval of Closed Session meeting minutes:
- November 6, 2009.
 - November 6, 2009.
 - November 10, 2009.
 - November 19, 2009.
 - November 19, 2009.
- B. Recommend approval of Open Session meeting minutes:
- April 14, 2009 Regular Board Meeting.
 - November 10, 2009 Regular Board Meeting.
- C. Recommend approval of the adoption of a resolution authorizing the Director of Storage and Distribution to dispose of surplus school property by way of on-line bid in auction format.

The on-line auction time span will encompass the January 4 through January 15, 2010 period. GovDeals, (www.govdeals.com) an experienced and proven on-line government surplus sales service provide, will facilitate the process.

- D. Recommend approval of Alternative Schools Local Options Goals.

Alternative Schools participate in the State ABCs based on Local Option Goals plus two proficiency goals set by the North Carolina Department of Public Instruction. The goals selected by the schools represent areas of focus to increase performance. Schools that meet three or four goals are labeled Expected Growth schools and schools that meet all five goals are labels High Growth schools. This item included goals for Turning Point Academy, Midwood High School (9th Grade Transition Program), and Hawthorne High School.

- E. Recommend approval of one citizen appointment to the Equity Committee by the Superintendent.

Dr. Gorman recommended the re-appointment of Rob Harrington for a three-year term ending November 30, 2012. Mr. Harrington completed serving a partial term which began June 30, 2008.

- F. Recommend approval of Title I LEA Improvement Plan 2009-2010.

Request approval for schools identified as Missing Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) for two consecutive years according to No Child Left Behind Act 2001; schools identified as low performing according to General Statute §115C-105.37; and revised Local Education Agency Improvement Plan.

- G. Recommend approval of licensed/non-licensed hires and promotions for November 2009.

- H. Recommend approval of School Improvement Plans.

As part of the school improvement process, schools are required to develop a School Improvement Plan each year. Each School Leadership Team develops the school plan in a collaborative process that involves parents, community, and schools staff, and the plan specifies the school's priorities for development and strategies to address them. Approval of this item includes School Improvement Plans for each of the 176 CMS schools.

- I. Recommend approval of appointment of administrative personnel.

Appointments:

- *LaToya Walker named Executive Director to the Office of the Superintendent. Ms. Walker previously served as intern with CMS from the Urban Superintendents Program at Harvard Graduate School of Education and Interim Director of Development with Washington Christian Academy in Silver Spring, Maryland.*
- *Vanessa Benton named Director of Academic Services. Ms. Benton previously served as a Broad Fellow in the Auxiliary Services Department.*
- *Theresa Townsend named principal at Joseph W. Grier Academy. Ms. Townsend previously served as assistant principal at Blythe Elementary School.*

- J. Recommend approval of temporary construction easement and a permanent drainage easement to the City of Charlotte on Charlotte-Mecklenburg Board of Education property located at 4000 Applegate Road.

The city of Charlotte requires a Temporary Construction Easement of 15,852 square feet and a Storm Water Drainage Easement of 76,678 square feet to make improvements to storm drainage facilities including the right to constructing (construction will include a detention pond), installing, improving, operating, inspecting, repairing and maintaining storm drainage facilities within the Easement Area at Collingswood Elementary School located at 4000 Applegate Road, Parcel No. 671-04-710.

Chairperson Davis called for a motion to adopt the Consent Agenda.

Mr. Merchant moved, seconded by Mr. White, that the Board adopt Consent Items A. through J., and the Board voted 9-0 in support of the motion.

IV. ACTION ITEMS

- A. Motions to rescind prior Board action to name the new high school the *W. A. Hough High School* and to reconvene the School Naming Committee, as requested by Kaye McGarry, Member At-Large

Chairperson Davis called for a motion to consider a motion to rescind the prior Board action to name the new high School the *W. A. Hough High School* and reconvene the School Naming Committee. Ms. Lennon thanked Ms. McGarry for putting this motion on the agenda on her behalf as she was unable to do so because she was not a Board member when the agenda was created. Ms. Lennon presented the following motion.

Ms. Lennon moved that the Board rescind the prior Board decision of the November 10, 2009 Board meeting to name the new high school the *W. A. Hough High School* and to reconvene the School Naming Committee, seconded by Ms. McGarry, and a discussion followed.

- Ms. Lennon said when she first heard the name of *Hough High School* she was quite impressed with Mr. Hough's legacy and she believes he is deserving of being honored in the community. The pronunciation issues are of little concern to her and she believes people could learn how to pronounce the name correctly. She has had time to speak with the students, parents, and the community regarding how they felt about the

process. There have been six new schools opened in north Mecklenburg since 1960. All six have been in the last decade and the precedent is clear. In each of those six school openings, a committee was assembled and they selected three names to recommend to the Board. Following those recommendations, the three names were passed on for student and parent involvement. In the case of the new high school on Bailey Road that did not happen. It was the expectation of this community based upon precedent of six previous school naming processes that this would be the case. Ms. Lennon said their expectation was not met and that is the reason she is bringing this motion before the Board.

- Ms. McGarry said she put this item on the agenda for Ms. Lennon. She believes there is a division in the northern portion of the county. She supported the motion in November and believes this is valid because it is not about the pronunciation but about the interpretation of the process. She is concerned about the division in the northern portion of the county and believes Ms. Lennon needs to be supported in an effort to bring the community together regardless of the outcome. She said the community should be heard and the Board should put forth an honest effort to review the naming process which was also the recommendation of the Town Council in Cornelius. She would support this step even if the results are the same.
- Mr. White said the Board is concerned about the complaints regarding the naming process and several people have asked the Superintendent to investigate this matter. Mr. White asked Dr. Gorman if the Board policy was followed? Dr. Gorman stated, yes, the school naming process was followed.

Chairperson Davis called for the Board vote on the motion to rescind the Board action regarding the naming of the new high school.

The Board voted 2-7 and the motion failed. Board members McGarry and Lennon voted in support of the motion. Board members Davis, Tate, Merchant, White, McElrath, Waddell, and Morgan voted against the motion.

- B. Motion to name the football stadium at North Mecklenburg High School the “William A. Hough Stadium” in memory of Mr. William A. Hough, former principal of North Mecklenburg High School, as requested by Kaye McGarry, Member At-large.

Item Deleted with the adoption of the agenda.

- C. Motions to rescind prior Board action taken on November 10, 2009 modifying the attendance areas for the Myers Park IB Magnet Program and to reinstate the Superintendent’s prior recommendation to delay changes for Myers Park High School IB Program pending review of IB Programs at all locations, as requested by Kaye McGarry, Member At-Large

Chairperson Davis called upon Ms. McGarry to introduce the recommendation. Ms. McGarry said the recommendation includes the two following motions:

1. Recommend approval of motion to rescind Board action taken on November 10, 2009 in which the feeder areas for Myers Park, East Mecklenburg and Harding International Baccalaureate Magnet Programs were modified and to thereby reinstate the current attendance areas for the Myers Park IB Magnet Program.

2. Recommend approval of motion to instate the Superintendent's recommendation of November 10, 2009 regarding the East Mecklenburg/Myers Park High School Student Assignment Options, Academic Programming Decision, and delay changes to the Myers Park IB Program until a full review of IB Programs at all locations is conducted.

The November 10, 2009 Board action included the following:

The attendance areas for the Myers Park International Baccalaureate (IB) Magnet, the East Mecklenburg IB and the Harding University High School IB Magnet Programs are modified as follows:

1. The Ardrey Kell and South Mecklenburg home school areas of the Blue Transportation zone are removed from the attendance area for the Myers Park IB Magnet Program and are assigned to the IB Magnet Program at East Mecklenburg, effective with the 2010-2011 school year. Transportation will be provided to East Mecklenburg for students living in these areas.
2. The Olympic and E.E. Waddell home school areas of the Blue transportation zone are removed from the attendance area for the Myers Park IB Magnet Program and are assigned to the IB Magnet Program at Harding University High School, effective with the 2010-2011 school year. Transportation will be provided to Harding for students living in these areas.
3. The Superintendent is directed to develop and bring to the Board for approval a revision to Exhibit JCA-E2, "Student Assignment Priorities - Magnet Programs," that creates enhanced priorities for admission to the Harding IB Program that precede other established priorities, in the following order:
 - a. All rising 9th grade students living in the Olympic and E.E. Waddell home school areas who successfully completed a middle school IB Program; and
 - b. All applicants to the Harding IB program who live in the Olympic and E.E. Waddell home school areas.
4. The Myers Park home school area will constitute the entire attendance area for the Myers Park IB Program, which will continue to operate as a Magnet Program.
5. Current 11th grade students living outside of the Myers Park home school area who are assigned to the IB Magnet Program at Myers Park may continue to attend Myers Park IB Magnet for their 12th grade year; transportation will be provided to these students. Younger siblings of these students do not have a sibling guarantee to attend Myers Park in the regular education program or the IB Program.

Ms. McGarry moved that that the Board approve a motion to rescind Board action taken on November 10, 2009 in which the feeder areas for Myers Park, East Mecklenburg, and Harding International Baccalaureate (IB) Magnet Programs were modified and to thereby reinstate the current attendance areas for the Myers Park IB Magnet Program, seconded by Ms. Lennon, and a discussion followed.

- Ms. McGarry thanked the parents and students for their good comments and the facts they presented earlier in the meeting. She was elected in 2003 and 2007 and her purpose as a Board member is to serve the community. She struggled whether to put this on the agenda and whether she should make a political decision or a decision based upon facts. She has opted to make an intelligent decision based upon facts because she

is serving as a Board member for the students. She reviewed some of the facts. The Myers Park IB Program is the first public IB Program in North Carolina and the first IB Middle Years Program in North America. It has been recognized nationally as one of the most successful IB Programs serving as a resource for other schools in CMS and across the nation so that they can build their programs. One of the greatest strengths of the Myers Park IB Program is its diversity with motivated students from different communities across Charlotte participating in the program. The students represent many different countries, backgrounds, and cultures. Myers Park has succeeded in building a culture where diversity, studying hard, performing well, and giving back to the community are embraced. Student achievement is the focus of CMS. Removing the feeder schools from Myers Park IB Program will remove 70% of the IB students from Myers Park, destroy much of its diversity of the program, and instead create a non-diverse program that is only open to those in the Myers Park zone. Ms. McGarry said some people may believe Myers Park is overcrowded but when you ask the staff you are told it is not overcapacity. The school is overcrowded but it is not overcapacity. While 3,000 students at Myers Park seem like a lot of students, the campus is designed to accommodate that many students. The campus consists of over sixty-three acres, thirteen buildings, dozens of classrooms, and that school can hold that number of students. Ms. McGarry said by next year the Myers Park IB Program enrollment will already be depleted because the Board previously approved phasing out the partial IB Programs. Based upon last year's enrollment, that would affect 250 students. She encouraged the Board to delay the decision to move the IB Program to determine the impact of that decision in the future and to have staff conduct a full IB Program review at all locations. This step would put all the facts on the table for the Board's consideration. She said this is an opportunity for the new Board to support the review and to help rebuild a sense of credibility and trust for the Board. She asked the Board to put politics aside and do what is best for the students. She said supporting this motion is the right action to take and that will show ownership and accountability. She encouraged the Board to support staff's recommendation presented in November.

- Ms. Lennon said she has a unique perspective that is similar to the Myers Park parents. She has a senior at North Mecklenburg High School in IB Program. She has already received her academic rewards and she is going to college. She will support Ms. McGarry's motion to rescind the action because it was the recommendation of the CMS staff to do a comprehensive review of all the IB Programs county wide.
- Chairperson Davis said he would like to share his thoughts. Over the past six months of student assignment discussions one thing is abundantly clear, we have much work to do on making student assignment decisions in a number of areas but particularly in three areas of policy, data, and process. First, the current policy is grounded in a growth expectation and clearly we are no longer in a growth mode in our city and county. We are in an era marked by austerity and efficiency. An era that requires a policy that emphasizes greater sharing of resources, collaboration, and team work. Second, despite the best efforts of our fine staff, far too often, the data that is presented raises more questions and confusion instead of providing clarity and direction. Third and most destructive, the process pits parents, students, and schools against one another and that tends to empower the loudest and the most divisive voices. Instead, we need a process that gives voice to those that can work across school lines. A process that stimulates

creativity in which builds instead of destroys our community. And most importantly, a process that delivers better solutions for this Board to consider. The planning process needs to be less reactive and crisis oriented and more strategic in which we anticipate issues and explore alternative solutions before a crisis erupts. Chairperson Davis said that is the work this Board begins tonight. Chairperson Davis said to this particular motion tonight and as a CMS parent with a child zoned for Myers Park High School, I share with you my fellow Myers Park parents your passionate arguments in defense of the Myers Park IB Program. Since the November 10th decision, I have explored with my colleagues and the CMS staff alternative solutions that might provide more impactful solutions for East Mecklenburg High School and would lessen the negative affects on Myers Park. The short time between the November 10th decision and tonight along with the complexities of those alternative solutions created insurmountable challenges to gain support for those new solutions. Tonight, the last meeting in which we can affect the next school year, the alternatives are two. Either, reverse course or move forward. Based upon discussions with his colleagues, it is clear there are not enough votes to reverse course. Chairperson Davis said in being mindful of our schools and students as a whole as well as the individual impacts on each student, he has determined that the best course as the representative in District 5 is to not reverse the decision but to move forward by aggressively addressing the resulting issues to create the best possible outcome from this decision. Chairperson Davis said he asks Dr. Gorman and his staff to ensure that we meet the educational needs of all of our IB Program students regardless of what school they attend and, if necessary, to ask this Board for what is needed in order to achieve that objective. Chairperson Davis said he commits to his fellow District 5 parents and students impacted by this decision all of his efforts to alleviate the negative affects and to accentuate the positives of this decision.

Chairperson Davis called for the Board vote on the on the motion presented by Ms. McGarry to rescind the Board action on November 10, 2009.

The Board voted 2-7 and the motion to rescind the Board action failed. Board members McGarry and Lennon voted in support of the motion. Board members Davis, Tate, Merchant, White, McElrath, Waddell, and Morgan voted against the motion.

V. REPORT/INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Report on Budget Amendments for October 2009

Dr. Gorman said Report Items A. and B. are the monthly reports and they are as presented.

B. Report on Financial Statements for October 2009

Report Item B. was presented with Report Item A.

C. Report on Teacher Incentive Fund – Leadership for Educator’s Advanced Performance (TIF-LEAP)

Chairperson Davis called upon Dr. Gorman to introduce the report. Dr. Gorman called upon Ann Clark, Chief Academic Officer, to present the report on Teacher Incentive Fund

– Leadership for Educator’s Advanced Performance (TIF-LEAP). Ann Clark introduced Susan Norwood, Executive Director for Teacher Incentive Fund – Leadership for Educator’s Advanced Performance. Ms. Clark recognized various members of the audience which included the members of the TIF-LEAP Steering Committee which is a cross-functional team representing the district office, schoolhouse, principals, teachers, and representatives from the teacher’s associations; members of the TIF-LEAP team; and partners from the Community Training and Assistance Center (CTAC). Ms. Clark said the Board had previously been provided information regarding the report in the Board packet and electronically. As a part of the report, Board members were invited to submit questions and staff is available to answer any additional questions as well as schedule meetings with the Board members should they wish to have additional insight regarding the TIF-LEAP Initiative.

Ms. Lennon stepped out of the meeting at 8:15 p.m.

Ms. Clark highlighted the following information:

- TIF-LEAP History: The Teacher Incentive Fund was authorized through the Departments of Labor, Health, and Human Services, and Education, and Related Agencies Appropriations Act, 2006, Title V, Part D.
 - Federal Appropriations in the amount of \$99,000,000.
 - CMS was awarded a five-year TIF Grant in 2007 to launch a Pay-for-Performance Program within the district in the amount of \$11,880,267. The program was given the name TIF-LEAP.
- TIF-LEAP Goals
 - Increase the number of *highly effective* teachers and principals to levels that allow for expansion, evaluation, and sustainability of a district wide, achievement-focused compensation system.
 - Create a *differentiated compensation system* for teachers and principals that provide differentiated levels of pay based on *student achievement gains* and *teacher/principal evaluations* including multiple observations.
 - Support the *recruitment* and *retention* of qualified teachers and principals in hard-to-staff schools and subjects.
 - Align and improve *support systems* to achieve goals.

Susan Norwood reviewed the following:

- TIF-LEAP Organization Chart. The chart represents the collaborative nature of this initiative and includes input from various divisions throughout the district for the grants development and ongoing changes. All stakeholders (teachers and principals) impacted by this initiative have the opportunity for input.
- TIF-LEAP Schools. (* Achievement Zone Schools).
 - Year 1 (2007-2008): Billingsville Elementary*, Martin Luther King, Jr. Middle*, Sedgfield Middle, Shamrock Gardens Elementary*, Bishop Spaugh Middle*, and J.W. Wilson Middle*.
 - Year 2 (2008-2009): Druid Hills Elementary, Highland Renaissance Elementary, John Taylor Williams Middle*, and Reid Park Elementary.
 - Year 3 (2009-2010): Waddell High*, Math and Science at Garinger, New Tech at

Garinger, Leadership and Public Service at Garinger, Business and Finance at Garinger, International Studies at Garinger, West Charlotte High*, West Mecklenburg High*, Berryhill Elementary, and Lincoln Heights Elementary.

- By Year 5, nearly 14,000 students and 1,300 teachers and principals will be involved in the program.
- TIF-LEAP Financial Incentives:
 - Recruitment Bonuses: Purpose is to attract quality teachers to CMS TIF-LEAP Schools by providing a recruitment bonus early during the hiring season in the amount of \$10,000 for teachers and principals who accept positions in hard-to-staff, high-need schools.
 - Merit-Based Supplements: Purpose to provide a performance-based bonus linked to student achievement and individual teacher and principal performance. Principals can receive up to \$4,000, assistant principals can receive up to \$3,500, teachers with EOC/EOC tests can receive up to \$5,300, and teachers without EOG/EOC tests can receive up to \$4,200.
 - ❖ Improving Instruction: Through extensive data analysis, teachers identify learner-centered problems and develop specific Student Learning Objectives (SLOs) to address and assess demonstrated needs.
 - ❖ Increasing Achievement: A district-developed growth measure that seeks to isolate a teacher's contribution to raising his/her students' test scores is being piloted this year in TIF-LEAP schools.
 - Stipend Pay: Purpose is to reward teachers and principals for participating in related professional development activities and to compensate teachers for taking on leadership roles and extra duties that are related to improving student achievement (\$115 per day (six contact hours) including benefits for attending approved professional development or assuming leadership roles and extra duties.
- TIF-LEAP Accountability:
 - Performance Evaluations: Principals must earn "Proficient" or above on the new North Carolina Executive Principal Evaluation Process; assistant principals must earn "Effective" or above on the CMS Assistant Principal Performance Appraisal System; and teachers must earn "At-Standard" or above on all functions of the North Carolina Teacher Performance Appraisal Instrument-Revised (TPAI-R) Summative Evaluation.
- TIF-LEAP Budget: Grant Costs in the amount of \$3,154,593.50 and Local Match in the amount of \$1,395,636.00 for a total budget of \$4,550,229.60.
- TIF-LEAP Results: Differentiated Compensation is one of the primary goals.
 - Year 1 (2007-2008) Merit-Based Supplements: \$468,177. 4 principals, 8 assistant principals, 173 teachers, and 10 other certified staff received supplements. A total of \$468,177 in TIF funds (\$405,135 for the supplement payment and \$63,042 for the associated fringe benefits) was utilized.
 - Year 2 (2008-2009) Recruitment Bonuses: \$489,808. Recipients received \$10,000 bonuses paid in two installments in September 2008 and February 2009. Seventeen teachers were paid from TIF totaling \$183,005 (\$170,000 for recruitment bonuses and \$13,005 for associated benefits). Local funds were used to pay thirty new or transferred educators in September and twenty-eight continuing employees in February.

- Professional Development/Leadership Stipends: \$122,784. Incentive stipend pay of \$115 per day (6 contact hours) was paid to teachers and administrators for time spent outside of regular work hours to attend professional development that was approved and directly related to student achievement and LEAP initiative goals. Teachers were also eligible for the same stipend pay rate for leadership roles and extra duties beyond the school day.
- Merit-Based Supplements: \$820,256. Merit-based supplements were paid to teachers who attained student achievement growth goals as measured by their SLO(s) and met performance and attendance criteria. Teachers received \$1,400 for one successful SLO and \$2,800 for two. Administrators were compensated for facilitating the SLO process: assistant principals received \$4,200 and principals received \$5,600.
- TIF-LEAP Lessons Learned/Next Steps:
 - The TIF-LEAP project is providing CMS an opportunity to learn more about viable reform options and to gather feedback and reactions from affected schools and teachers.
 - Opportunity to review data to study effectiveness and to reward and compensate teachers and administrators that are truly effective.
 - Lessons learned from the TIF-LEAP Initiative will help inform the development of *Strategic Plan 2014's* Pay-for-Performance model.

Dr. Gorman said CMS does have a history of Performance Pay initiatives that were traditionally led by the Accountability Department and Human Resources Department. This initiative is being led by Curriculum and Instruction and that is where it is best housed. Some of those initiatives (local accountability bonus, Master Teacher and Administrator Incentive, High School Challenge, and Star Teacher Incentive) have gone away over time. The elimination of programs midway through the year has been a real challenge for teachers and it is difficult to get them to buy into programs. For example, this year many teachers qualified for the state ABC Bonus but it was eliminated due to the state budget shortfall. They were upset that those dollars were taken away. There are many lessons that have been learned over the years that are being implemented in TIF-LEAP. Current incentive programs that are still in place include the State National Board Certification Program, the Strategic Staffing Program, and the North Carolina State ABC Program is still on the books but it is questionable whether it will be funded this year. In reviewing TIF-LEAP, staff considered a learning laboratory as we move forward with the Strategic Plan. Important considerations include ensuring measures are thoughtful in developing pay for performance, how to do it with staff and not to staff, and how to ensure employees know the incentive will be long lasting and it is not a fad or a program that will be taken away after they have earned the reward.

Board members were invited to ask questions.

- Dr. Waddell noted that the program had been changed several times since 2007. She asked staff to consider two suggestions in moving forward with the Pay-for-Performance Program. Consider years of experience that teachers have in the system as a factor and advanced degrees because many of the subject areas require an advanced degree in order to qualify for certification. Dr. Waddell said change is difficult and she

commended the positive steps (incentive pay, reward for taking advanced classes, advancing knowledge to be better teachers, and professional development) resulting from the program. Dr. Gorman said staff will be bringing the Board more research on CMS related to years of experience and advanced degrees. That research is not completed and staff believes there are other related topics that the Board will be interested in discussing at upcoming Board meetings.

- Mr. Tate thanked staff for the work that has been completed. Mr. Tate asked clarifying questions how the program will be funded after the grant funding has been depleted. He expressed concern regarding the difficulties with the state and county budget shortfalls and the ability to fund this program in the future. Ms. Clark said CMS has a unique opportunity and is one of five school districts in the state to be invited to present an alternative compensation plan to the state. Staff is in the process of developing the plan and it will be presented to the Board upon its completion. CMS is using TIF-LEAP as a laboratory to test different approaches to teacher compensation and moving towards the goals in the *Strategic Plan 2014*. There are potential sources of funding in which teachers are compensated such as teacher experience, advanced degrees, and local accountability bonus. Other options will be included in the alternative compensation plan presented to the state for state funding or consideration. Dr. Gorman said there will be a continuation of funding for TIF through federal funding and CTAC. Staff believes, ultimately, performance pay should become a part of the budgeting process and it needs to be prioritized and put in place. That could take multiple years and involve the ebbs and flows of the economy. It can be a challenge to make that a priority in an \$87 million budget reduction year but that would be a part of the prioritization presented to the Board. Mr. Tate said he wants to see this finished and wants to ensure this is a priority in the budget. Mr. Tate expressed concern that a slide showed a higher pay for a teacher teaching an EOC or EOG subject as opposed to a teacher in a non-EOC/EOG area. He expressed concern that this could cause a division in the importance of teachers and school spirit. Ms. Clark said an exciting component of Measuring Teacher Effectiveness with the Gates Foundation will include testing tools and evaluation measuring rubrics with EOC and EOG teachers and reviewing student test results against how they performed on the rubric. They hope to be able to draw conclusions that if they were using that tool or rubric with a teacher in a non-EOC/EOG area to also determine their teacher effectiveness. This is an incredible opportunity as a community and a district to inform the nation on the question that has not been answered in K-12 public education. How do you measure the effectiveness of a teacher absent a test whether it a state test or a national test? Mr. Tate said he hopes at some point there may be an equal amount of pay for the two. Dr. Gorman said that is the goal. Mr. Tate expressed concern regarding the number of schools in which there is excessive mobility of students and those teachers may not get credit for student achievement results as opposed to those teachers with the same students throughout the year. Ms. Clark said the ABC Program and TIF-LEAP takes in consideration the number of days a student is in attendance at a particular program. There is a 120-day rule used as a measurement and that helps to equalize the process. Students must be in attendance in a given classroom with a specific teacher and school before they will be counted towards the composite score and student growth for that particular teacher. Mr. Tate asked clarifying questions regarding the growth requirements and Ms. Clark

responded. Mr. Tate wants to ensure the program recognizes those types of circumstances and rewards those who are doing their very best and especially those in the most challenging situations.

- Mr. Merchant said he is the Board liaison to the TIF-LEAP Initiative. He has reviewed the initiative closely and he hopes people will pay attention to this because it is a game changer for CMS locally and nationally. Mr. Merchant has discussed this with Bill Slotnik, Executive Director with Community Training and Assistance Center (CTAC), and it is important to get past the what, who, and where and focus on the why. The Board has heard about this program in pieces: accountability, challenges, advances, reasons the initiative is housed in Curriculum and Instruction, student learning objectives, and the importance of empowering teachers and getting their feedback on what they want their students to learn. It is now important to take those pieces in an intentional manner and focus on why CMS is implementing this program and explicitly communicate this to the public so that they understand. The Board has begun to talk less about highly qualified teachers and more about highly effective teachers and that is crossing over in discussions about years of experience and advanced degrees. Mr. Merchant asked where are we in determining the definition of an effective teacher or an effective management scheme? Dr. Gorman said from an operations side of the district we are further along and the recent key performance indicators were robust and considered national benchmarks and standards. Today the district shared the recent NAEP data and that is the only large scale comparative data we have on the instructional side but that data cannot be broken down by teacher. Taking that data to a classroom level provides no insight. That data is considered to be difficult to measure but the district is going to continue to attempt to develop and calculate that data. The Gates Foundation will be a two year program and we are three months into the process. Ms. Clark said we have taken a huge step with the TIF-LEAP growth measure that we are exploring with the teachers and principals in the twenty schools and we have the benefit of now having elementary, middle, and high schools participating for the first time. This is a great opportunity to test a particular growth measure, get feedback, make midyear corrections, and review the results at the end of the year. There are two years remaining with TIF-LEAP to explore different methods that we can use. The Gates Program is going to accelerate our ability to do this for all teachers. The Strategic Plan maps it out clearly over a four year period of time. The state of North Carolina is very eager for CMS to step forward with a proposal and they are calling on a regular basis to be updated on the status of the initiative. Dr. Gorman said he recently attended a meeting with the State Superintendent and the Governor and they indicated they were supportive of the CMS initiative and the state is standing behind CMS. Dr. Gorman reported that the Board would be updated over the next five weeks on *Race to the Top* which has an incredibly compressed timeline. This an application the State is making. The Federal Register which defines the terms within *Race to the Top*, lists a highly effective teacher as a teacher whose students average 1.5 years growth in one year's time. An effective teacher is a teacher whose students average one year's growth in one year's time. From a federal government standpoint, it is clear they are pushing towards student academic growth. One of the challenges is there are fifty states with their own standards for measuring one year's growth in a year's time. Staff will continue to keep the Board updated and the North Carolina School Boards Association and teachers

associations will also be sharing information. Dr. Gorman said soon this Board will be asked to sign off on a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the State regarding this initiative. He encouraged the Board to pay attention to this because CMS is moving down a path of performance-based compensation using TIF-LEAP as a learning laboratory and the state is moving down a path directed by the federal Department of Education. Dr. Gorman said at the next Board meeting, the Board will receive an update on this and may be asked to consider Board approval based upon the tight time line. At this point, we do not have the application from the state and staff will regularly update the Board on pertinent information. Dr. Gorman said it is clear that student academic growth is at the forefront at the federal and state levels. Mr. Merchant said it is important that the Board have agreement and buy in upfront because this initiative will have tremendous value and that will outweigh the costs of sustainability funding overtime. Mr. Merchant believes it will be of value to tie what students learn with what teachers earn. Mr. Merchant asked Dr. Gorman to let the Board know what they can do to build trust in the community and partnerships with foundations and local, state, and federal governments. He encouraged Dr. Gorman to be explicit with communication to the Board and the community.

Ms. Lennon returned to the meeting at 8:35 p.m.

- Mr. McElrath said pay-for-performance is a great idea and it should have been in place years ago. Mr. McElrath asked how involved have the teacher associations been in this process? Ms. Clark said representatives from the Charlotte Teacher Association and NCAE are on the Steering Committee and the committee also includes teacher and principal representatives from the twenty schools involved in the program. Dr. Gorman said the MOU required by the federal government by states for *Race to the Top* is explicit and requires three signatures: the superintendent, school board chair, and teacher association leader. Mr. McElrath said he has attended teacher association meetings and he got the feeling that they are not in support of this initiative and they listed a page of items that they did not like. For example, if an advanced degree is specific to what you are teaching then at some level it does help academic performance. Teacher associations are concerned that it does not recognize subject specific, advanced degrees, and teacher experience and this may pit teacher against teacher. Mr. McElrath expressed concern that teachers do not trust this initiative at this point. Dr. Gorman said we should not expect them to be onboard 100% at this point. Currently, CMS has a pay structure that is based upon years experience and advanced degrees and those criteria add to your salary. There is the impression that CMS values those who are paid more and they are valued more. Staff will be bringing data to the Board in the next few months that are CMS specific that shows the impact on student achievement, in the courses where it is measurable, with teachers with years of experience and advanced degrees as well as national research. It is easy to understand the concerns of the teachers because we have had a system that has been in place for years. We have told the teachers how to navigate through the system but now we are telling them a different structure. Dr. Gorman said he understands the concerns of the teachers. Staff will review the CMS data and we will do this with the teachers and not to them. This information will be shared with the Board and the public. The Governor has indicated that this could be difficult for some individuals in reviewing student academic

performance and in particular to teacher associations that have operated under a specific structure.

- Mr. White said this may be the most important and most challenging initiative that we have implemented in education in a long time. If we are truly going to raise the bar for all and eliminate the gap than we must do these dramatic changes. People typically do not like dramatic change. The public must understand the importance of this initiative. The Board must understand the challenges of this program and do what is necessary to sell it to the public. The bottom line is CMS must find a way to measure whether a student is learning. If a student is not learning, we are not getting the job done. Mr. White said a teacher does not have control over where that child is when it starts school and we can not hold them responsible for what they receive. We can hold them responsible for what they turn out at the end of the year. For CMS to get where we want to go, preparing every kid for life, we must make this change.
- Chairperson Davis said he supports this effort and applauds Dr. Gorman and his staff for taking the lead in moving CMS in a new direction. He believes this is the direction that CMS should go and the faster we move at a responsible pace the better. Chairperson Davis asked Dr. Gorman to let the Board know how they can lead this effort and support the cause.

D. Management Oversight Report on Construction and Facility Maintenance

Chairperson Davis called upon Dr. Gorman to introduce the Management Oversight report on Construction and Facility Maintenance. Dr. Gorman said this report combines construction and facility maintenance and called upon Guy Chamberlain, Associate Superintendent for Auxiliary Services, to present the report. Mr. Chamberlain said Building Services is ably led by Phil Berman, Executive Director of Facilities, and he has been in this position for over ten years. Mr. Berman took over following a major reorganization and has been responsible for a quantum change in the Building Services organization. Building Services, a division of Auxiliary Services, plans for and maintains building systems and physical environments. Building Services is comprised of custodial, energy management, engineering, maintenance, property management, environmental health and safety, and support services departments. CMS is among the largest property and facilities management operations in North Carolina with 176 schools, 15 administrative support sites, 649 buildings, 982 mobile classrooms in operation, 20.6 million square feet of occupied space, and 4,892 acres of land. Mr. Chamberlain reviewed key points regarding Building Services.

- Building Services has made substantial gains in its capabilities.
 - Acknowledged two years ago as one of twelve facility operations in the United States by the Association for School Business Officials by receiving the Master Facility Award. Singularly, that was a good achievement for CMS.
 - Acknowledged by the North Carolina Awards for Excellence for its business operations.
 - Acknowledged three times by the Environmental Protection Agency for achievements.
 - Continuing towards continuous improvement.
- Key Business Operations.
 - Operations and Maintenance Services.

- Support Services.
- Governance.
- Budget: \$83 million.
 - \$5.7 million relocating mobiles and mobile replacement.
 - \$29.9 million Custodial Service.
 - \$19.5 million Maintenance Services.
 - \$27.1 million Utilities.
- 2009-2010 Major Goals:
 - ISO 9001 Certification (quality improvement).
 - Installation of Global Positional System (GPS) on all service fleet.
 - Biometric Time and Attendance System.
 - Implement Environmental Management System.
 - Implement Energy Savings Rebate Program.
 - Reduce Energy cost by \$2.4 million.
- Major Initiatives:
 - Partnership with North Carolina Department of Environment and National Resources.
 - Special Maintenance Response Team.
 - Implementation of OSHA Quality Management System.
 - GPS for Maintenance and Custodial Vehicle System.
 - Mercury Containing Lamp Recycling.
- Performance Results:
 - Commercial Property Management model for K-12 Facilities Management.
 - Implemented Environment Protection Agency (EPA) recognized models for Indoor Air Quality.
 - Integrated Pest Management System.
 - Green Cleaning
- Next Steps:
 - ISO 9001 Certification (quality management system) by 2010.
 - Continued implementation of EMS using ISO 14001 standard as a guide.
 - Energy Star (EPA energy-management software) rating of at least fifty schools by 2014.
 - Resolving Indoor Air Quality deficiencies at CMS schools that require significant funds.
 - Assessment of future Building Services computer maintenance management system and Lawson Integration requirements.
- Results:
 - Commercial Property Management model for K-12 Facilities Management.
 - Implemented Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) recognized models for Indoor Air Quality.
 - Integrated Pest Management.
 - Green Cleaning.

Mr. Chamberlain reviewed key points regarding Capital Program Services.

- Key Business Operations:
 - Design Procurement and Management.

- Construction Services Procurement and Management.
- Furniture Fixtures and Equipment Implementation.
- Project Closeout and Warranty Management.
- Laws, Ordinances, Regulations, and Policies:
 - North Carolina General Statutes regarding procurement.
 - North Carolina Building Code.
 - Fire Code.
 - Zoning Ordinances.
 - Municipal Ordinances.
- Budgeting/Finance:
 - Executed over \$1.5 billion over last ten years in construction both in new schools and renovations.
 - Average \$150 million per year.
 - 72% of funding for construction, 10% for land, 4.7% for design.
 - Program Management is 2.88% which is extremely low (typically in excess of 7%).
- 2009-2010 Major Goals:
 - Complete all projects on time and within budget.
 - ISO 9001 certification.
 - Achieve construction project closeout within 180 days.
 - Increase minority and small business participation.
 - Incorporate recycling into capital project contracts.
 - Incorporate building information modeling technology into design process.
- Major Initiatives:
 - Building Envelope Performance Study.
 - Revised Design Review process.
 - Improved contractor performance in project commissioning.
 - Prototype development.
 - Post occupancy surveys.
 - Annual lessons learned reviews.
 - Annual project turnover plan.
 - Accelerated project closeout process.
- Performance Results:
 - Completed all 2009 turnovers on time and within budget.
 - Performance score on 13 of 17 Key Performance Indicators were 4.0 or greater and 8 of 13 were 5.0 which is the top of the scale.
- Next Steps:
 - Prepare for future Bond Referendum. Next year in January or February, Mike Raible, Executive Director for Planning and Project Management, and Dennis LaCaria, Facilities Planning Specialist, will present to the Board a revised Ten Year Capital Plan for consideration for the next Bond Referendum anticipated for 2012.
 - Improve average number of days to complete the closeout process (Key Point Indicator #10).
 - Gather data for Key Point Indicator #12 and based upon results initiate appropriate actions to continue positive improvement.
 - Insure projects scheduled to bid in 2010 meet or exceed standards of Key Point Indicator #13.

Dr. Gorman encouraged the Board to meet with Mr. Chamberlain at Auxiliary Services to review the site, to tour the district, and discuss facility related areas. He also encouraged the Board to meet with Mike Raible to review land related items. Chairperson Davis believes it would be beneficial for the Board members to also visit the high priority project and renovation locations.

Board members were invited to make comments and ask questions.

- Dr. Waddell asked clarify questions regarding the difficulties and plans for increasing the number of minority businesses. Mr. Chamberlain reviewed the Disparity Study conducted five years ago, the goals of participation, the components of the program, and the steps to increase participation. Dr. Waddell said this is interesting because we are in an economic downturn and many businesses are going out of business because they cannot find work.
- Mr. Morgan asked Mr. Chamberlain to explain any successes or challenges in utilizing the state lease purchase regulations. Dr. Gorman said we were excited about the potential of the program and CMS was one of the first districts to pursue this alternative funding source but several challenges developed. Mr. Chamberlain said it took almost a year to work with the local government in Raleigh to develop a financial model that they would accept. The lease costs were close to the debt service costs and it was not cost effective. Mr. Chamberlain explained the capital lease process, the County issuance of Certificates of Participation (COPS), and the control of debt issuance. CMS is still considering the potential of Public-Private Partnerships.
- Mr. Merchant asked if the low 2.88% Program Management costs were a reflection of the CMS partnership with Bovis? Mr. Chamberlain said, absolutely, and that is essentially their fee. Mr. Merchant commended Mr. Chamberlain, staff, and Bovis for this success story and he hopes CMS will continue to find other similar strategic partnerships. Mr. Merchant asked clarifying questions regarding CMS utilizing a commercial property management scheme noting that property managers are responsible for 50% more than the standard. Mr. Chamberlain said there is one property manager assigned to each Learning Community. They are responsible for meeting with each principal and ensuring each principal is satisfied with the level of service they are getting (custodial, maintenance, and any concerns related to Auxiliary Services) but focused on the facility. This provides the principal a go to person to solve any property problems. Mr. Chamberlain said they are managing the work load at this point but at some point they will get overloaded. Dr. Gorman said this is a reflection of the tough fiscal times. With each budget reduction we strived to not cut the classroom and over time Mr. Chamberlain's staff has been reduced. Dr. Gorman said at some point this will need to be addressed in the budget because it could potentially put our investments in jeopardy if we can not adequately care for and maintain our properties. Mr. Chamberlain addressed concerns regarding the challenges of having warehouses with no air conditioning and refrigerator units that are old housing the food for the students and the inadequate bus facility at Craig Avenue that is maintaining the buses that drive 135,000 miles each day with our students. Mr. Chamberlain encouraged the Board to tour the Craig Avenue facility. Mr. Merchant said a challenge for the Board in making those tough calls is getting caught up in costs and losing the value proposition. He encouraged the Board to take care of the assets

and expressed concern that the low maintenance costs (\$.95 per square foot) may not be adequately caring for our facilities. He encouraged Dr. Gorman to let the Board know what it will take to operate at an acceptable or effective level. Mr. Merchant said we must take responsibility for the functions we cannot afford to fund and he suggested staff seek funding options such as outside partnerships.

- Chairperson Davis asked what is the degree of defer maintenance that we currently have and what are the efforts to maintain and control that because that is an area in which cost reductions typically occur? Dr. Gorman said some of the defer maintenance is outsourced to other groups such as HVAC. We are adding to defer maintenance each time a new school is opened and we do not have the needed financial support we are speeding up the defer maintenance process. Chairperson Davis said to better understand the risk, he would like additional information regarding a dollar amount of the activities that staff believe they should be doing but do not have funding for because of defer maintenance. Chairperson Davis asked clarifying questions regarding the benefits of using Program Management. Mr. Chamberlain said an advantage is the ability to draw the expertise from the private sector that we would have difficulty paying for with our salary schedule. We are able to use seasoned construction professionals on an as needs basis. As we have downsized the construction needs we have also been able to downsize the organization as the monthly expenditures have decreased and the workload has decreased. Mr. Chamberlain said an objective will be to maintain that level with the new school openings for next year. Chairperson Davis applauded the use of metrics and standards and he encouraged staff to raise those standards as the targets are met.

VI. REPORT FROM SUPERINTENDENT

Dr. Gorman welcomed the new Board members (Mr. McElrath, Mr. Morgan, Mr. Tate, Dr. Waddell, and Ms. Lennon) to the Board. He said he and staff look forward to working with them for the next four years. He invited the Board to call staff for anything that they need because they are there to serve and to meet the needs of students.

VII. REPORTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

Dr. Joyce Waddell reported that she had attended the celebration of the beginning of the IB Program at Irwin Avenue Elementary School. She was impressed with the number of parents, volunteers, and community partners who attended the event and the enthusiasm of everyone and the students. She enjoyed being a substitute teacher at Hidden Valley. She commended the students on being orderly and the cleanliness of the school. She plans to visit the Achievement Zone tomorrow.

Rhonda Lennon said she is excited to serve as a Board member and to serve the students. In the past month her district has become divided on the process for naming the new Hough High School. With the Board's decision tonight, she hopes the northern area will begin to move forward on the future of the community and the future of Hough High School. She wanted to ensure all sides had an opportunity to be heard and she believes putting this item on the agenda was the right thing to do. Ms. Lennon formally asked the Policy Committee to review the naming process to ensure the parent and student involvement piece is consistent in the future. She asked all the parents in north

Mecklenburg to put their differences aside and to move forward because the students in the area need a community that is united to support their successes and the three schools (North Mecklenburg, Hopewell, and Hough high schools) in north Mecklenburg to be the best they can be. She encouraged the Hough alumni to honor Mr. Hough by getting involved in the schools by using their time, talent, and money to support all the schools and to also consider creating a legacy scholarship to award a student each year who exemplifies the character traits of Mr. Hough. She hopes the parents of the new school will support the new school and faculty and she urged them to get active with their children's education. She encouraged the students to lead the way towards unity in the community. Ms. Lennon looks forward to serving on the Board for the next four years.

Joe White congratulated the new Board members, Mr. Davis on his appointment as Chairperson, and Mr. Tate on his appointment as Vice-Chairperson. He commended Chairperson Davis for doing a good job on chairing his first meeting. He also congratulated the outgoing Board members for doing a good job in serving this community long and well. He said often times good people who do the right thing are overlooked. This year, we knew the budget process was going to be challenging and people would be asked to give up money. Mr. White commended Dr. Gorman for stepping forward and removing himself from bonus eligibility for this year based upon the budget reductions. That was not the decision of the Board but the decision of Dr. Gorman and that should be noteworthy of recognition. Mr. White thanked Dr. Gorman for being an exemplary individual. Mr. White also thanked Dr. Terri Cockerham, principal of W. A. Hough High School. Dr. Cockerham left a secure position at one of our most decorated high schools to open a new high school which is a very responsible and challenging position. Mr. White encouraged the parents and students of the new school to enjoy the beautiful new facility and to support this outstanding principal and staff to have one of the most decorated high schools in the state. He wished everyone a safe and happy holiday season and a Merry Christmas.

Trent Merchant congratulated the new Board members and he welcomed them to the Board of Education. He looks forward to working with everyone and believes they will be a good team. He has met with some of the parents regarding the Board decision for a new elementary school at Dilworth. He is pleased to hear that the parents that were on all sides of that decision are working together to make that school successful and get it off to a great launch. He thanked the parents for helping to make that decision work and he hopes others will emulate that attitude.

Tom Tate introduced Meredith Lorenz who is working with Teach for America in their development work. Mr. Tate said he is serving as a mentor for her in the Mentoring Program for Future Board Members with the Center for Reform of School Systems. Ms. Lorenz is also providing assistance with the Policy Committee regarding addressing equity. Mr. Tate thanked the Board members for electing Mr. Davis Chairperson and himself Vice-Chairperson. Chairperson Davis showed excellent leadership tonight in chairing the meeting. Mr. Tate said it is important that the Board move forward as a team and he pledged to work with Chairperson Davis and the Board to make that possible. He also commended the departing Board members for their service to CMS. He looks forward to moving forward and working together to make CMS the best district in the United

States.

Kaye McGarry said the Board's vote tonight to dismantle the Myers Park IB Program spoke volumes to the voters of Mecklenburg County and she believes there will be repercussions from that decision for years to come. She hopes the trend to dismantle successful programs within CMS ends tonight. She expressed concern that the national reputation may go away and that the students will suffer the most. She invited everyone to join her at the next "Kaye About Town" at the Starbucks at Park Road and Woodlawn on January 14th from 7:30 a.m. to 9:00 a.m. She will be available to discuss school related issues and answer questions regarding CMS. She thanked the public for their ongoing support and feedback. She will pledge to study the issues, do her homework with the help of the voters, and to vote responsibly. Ms. McGarry looks forward to working with the new Board members and returning Board members and moving forward as a team. She wished everyone a Merry Christmas and happy Hanukah.

Tim Morgan congratulated the Butler High School football team (Bulldogs) on their successes and wished them the best in the upcoming State Champion game this weekend. They have done a remarkable job in representing CMS.

Richard McElrath congratulated Mr. Davis and Mr. Tate on their appointment as Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson. He looks forward to working with the Board and believes it will be a good mix. He visited Smith Language Academy and it was amazing to see the kindergarten students taking instruction in so many foreign languages. He expressed concern that the school is in need of renovations and school could have looked better. He is disturbed about the West Charlotte High School situation and believes it would be beneficial to put those students in a program, outside of West Charlotte, that will teach them a skill. He hopes the Board can develop a policy to address students who reach a certain educational level and how to make them successful.

Eric Davis reported he attended the 2009 Spirit for Caring Breakfast hosted by Wells Fargo in which Wells Fargo announced the donation of over \$6 million in grants to a number of charities in our community including a \$250,000 donation to Communities in Schools and comparable donations to two CMS Programs: New Leaders for New Schools and Parent University. This is a wonderful show of support by a major employer in recognizing the importance of public education to our business community. Chairperson Davis thanked the most recent departing Board members and those who came before them for their legacy of positive energy and leadership from the Board of Education. He is happy to be a part of that long standing tradition. Chairperson Davis thanked Molly Griffin for her twelve years of service to CMS and the community and serving as Chairperson for the past year. Chairperson Davis said to the parents that may have been disappointed this evening, he is optimistic about the future of CMS. There are significant challenges but he is optimistic with the new Board members. The Board brings the same differences, different experiences and perspectives, that have always existed on the Board but he senses a much stronger commitment to tackle the issues and to not attack the personalities; to leverage the differences as strength; and to recognize that two people can see the same issue and drive at different conclusions but stay engaged to find the best solution for our community. The Board also has a desire to learn and to learn from each other. He believes these are admirable qualities of eight leaders that he is proud to have as

colleagues on this Board. He is optimistic about the future. He believes there is much to tackle and the Board will enjoy much success together with a terrific community.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Davis called for a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Mr. White moved, seconded by Mr. Merchant, that the Board adjourn the Regular Board meeting, and by consensus, the Board agreed to adjourn the meeting.

The Regular School Board Meeting adjourned at 9:55 p.m.

Eric Davis, Chairperson

Nancy Daughtride, Clerk to the Board