

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

November 14, 2012

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Roger Dahnert

Mr. Don Duffy

Mr. Tom Egan

Ms. E-Mei Ervin

Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair

Mr. Bradley Norvell

Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair

Mr. Curtis Watkins

Ms. Lisa Yarbrough

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Dr. Lili Corbus

Ms. Debra Glennon, Second Vice Chair

Mr. Tom Low

OTHERS PERSENT:

Mr. John Rogers, Administrator

Historic District Commission

Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the

Historic District Commission

Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney

With a quorum present Chairman George called the regular November meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:08 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part of the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Index of Addresses:	1003 Romany Road	Dilworth
	1210 Myrtle Avenue	Dilworth
	600 West 8 th Street	Fourth Ward
	1923 Dilworth Road East	Dilworth
	1016 Ideal Way	Dilworth
	500 East Tremont Avenue	Dilworth
	708 Templeton Avenue	Dilworth
	2125 Dilworth Road East	Dilworth
	501 East Worthington Avenue	Dilworth
	1510 Hamorton Place	Plaza Midwood
	318 Settlers Lane	Fourth Ward

Application: 1003 Romany Road – New Construction.

This address is a new lot carved out of a large side yard at Romany Road and Lexington Avenue. The HDC recently deferred new construction plans for further design study and additional information. Revised plans show a simplification of material choices, separated gables, shed dormer, stone detail below front window removed, boxed bay on front, shingles in the gables.

Applicant Comments: The architect and the builder pointed out that they have adopted a Craftsman Bungalow style with brackets, stone column with a battered base and same stone chimney. The new plans show more cedar, 4/1 window pattern, stone has been removed from below the front windows, a copper roof

over windows, picture windows are gone, side elevation has been enhanced with more windows.

FOR/AGAINST: Adjacent Property Owner Marcia Rouse spoke in opposition of the proposed new construction.

Adjacent Property Owner John Luke spoke in opposition of the proposed new construction.

Neighborhood Resident John Phares spoke in opposition of the proposed new construction.

MOTION: Based on the need for additional information regarding setback and topography, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Mr. Watkins seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED.

Application: 1210 Myrtle Avenue – Addition.

This c. 1930 house on Myrtle Avenue is one of the smallest on the block. A second story is proposed by raising the ridge of the side to side gable. A full two story element will tie below the new ridge. Existing front porch column element will be repeated on the new rear porch. The roof step down on the right side will be simplified from three step downs to two. Cementitious siding is being requested.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition with wood siding and wooden columns. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED WITH WOOD SIDING.

Application: 600 West 8th Street – Rail Corridor Renovation.

The rail line that runs along the back side of Smith Street is being redone. There will be a grade separation with the rail line lowered. A 3400' trench will be

created which will improve the rail service between Charlotte and Raleigh. Landscaping and a fence at the top of the trench will be submitted for a later date. This project will also have to go to the Historic Landmarks Commission due to the adjacent cemetery. This is an information session for the Historic District Commission.

Applicant Comments: Ryan White of the NCDOT – Rail Division said this will be a measure to deflect noise and create a visual barrier of an area where rail cars will be stored. Necessary reviews include 106, SHPO, HDC, HLC. The public meeting is set for December 11.

1923 Dilworth Road East – Garage New Construction.

This c. 1927 house sits on a nearly triangular lot at the corner of Dilworth Road East and Ideal Way. A one story garage with a studio space behind is proposed for the rear yard with entry from the side street. The garage is pulled back from the line up of the adjacent Ideal Way home.

FOR/AGAINST: Adjacent Property Owner Paula DeLoma spoke in opposition to the proposed garage plan.

Adjacent Property Owner Diane Crutchfield spoke in opposition to the proposed garage plan.

Adjacent Property Owner Michael Baker spoke in opposition to the proposed garage plan.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Accessory Structures, Garages***, Mr. Watkins made a MOTION to APPROVE the garage as submitted. Mr. Duffy seconded

VOTE: 5/4 AYES: EGAN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: DAHNERT, DUFFY, ERVIN, YARBROUGH

DECISION: GARAGE APPROVED.

Application: 1016 Ideal Way – Addition.

A large addition and renovation was deferred last month for further design work. Revised plans show: shakes on the second floor, keep brick on first floor, French doors on front right, rear facing gable addition, secondary front facing gable, 6/1 windows, screened porch on rear.

Applicant Comments: Builder Peter Vesseur said because the house is so narrow that an addition will have to be pushed to the rear. The new roof will be kept simple. An appropriate balustrade will be added to the front. A match for the brick pattern has been found but the color is not a match, which is why the request is to paint the brick. Existing brick will be salvaged and reused but there will still be the need for some new.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the additions/renovations with a window added to the front gable. Based on no exception warranted the brick will not be painted. Mr. Ristaino seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED. PAINTING BRICK NOT APPROVED. WINDOW WILL BE ADDED TO FRONT GABLE.

Application: 500 East Tremont Avenue – New Construction.

A 365 Day Stay of Demolition was imposed in July on the triplex which sits on this lot at the corner of Tremont and Lyndhurst Avenues. At the time a 90 day no review was waived with the possibility of the remainder of the stay be considered for lifting with approved plans. Plans show a cross gable house with a large forward facing shed dormer for the second floor. An attached rear garage is entered from the side street.

Applicant Comments: Architect Josie Bulla said the big grade change drove the plan to attach the garage to be closer to the grade of the house.

FOR/AGAINST: Adjacent Property Owner Kelly Graber spoke in opposition of the attached garage.

MOTION: Based on the need to see a plan with a detached garage and detail resolution, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Mr. Ristaino seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED.

Mr. Ristaino declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Commission for the next application.

Application: 708 Templeton Avenue – Addition.

This one and one half story brick house is located between Euclid and Myrtle Avenues. A new front facing gable is to be added. The right and left elevations will have side facing cross gables connected by a shed. A large rear shed will accommodate the new second floor. Lapped wood siding will be on the new second floor above existing brick.

Applicant Comments: Architect Karen Barton said the T 111 will be removed in the existing front gable and be replaced with lapped wood.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED.

Application: 2125 Dilworth Road East – Porch Enclosure.

This c. 1925 house is located near the intersection of Dilworth Road East and West. The proposal is to enclose an existing screened side porch. The columns will remain and fixed French doors with trim above and below will be added.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines, Additions, Porch Enclosure***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the porch enclosure. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: PORCH ENCLOSURE APPROVED.

Application: 501 East Worthington Avenue – Addition.

A second floor addition was approved in March of 2004. This approval has expired and the request is for it to be renewed.

Applicant Comments: Contractor Rick Norvell said the only changes are: (1) expand the existing gable from side to side rather than the previously shown small one, (2) eliminate the arched window in the front gable and replace it with a triple set of rectangular windows.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition as submitted with final drawings which show the window change to be submitted to staff. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED WITH FINAL PLANS TO STAFF.

Application: 1510 Hamorton Place – Fenestration Changes/Addition.

Renovation is underway with an interior permit. Other things have come up for approval: (1) eliminate a secondary front door, (2) add a bracketed shed over upper front windows.

Applicant Comments: Mr. Osama Esmaeel said he is knocking off a rear addition that could not be saved. The entire house will be resided in wood and all windows will be replaced with wooded 1/1 with a 5" mullion where the windows are grouped.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions, Window Replacement, Restoration***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE: (1) appropriate exterior window trim, (2) replacement windows – 1/1 or 2/2, (3) rear arch, (4) remove secondary front door, (5) wood siding. NOTE: Bonnet over front windows is not approved. Ms. Yarbrough seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: CHANGES APPROVED – SEE MOTION.

Application: 318 Settlers Lane – Fenestration change.

An application was reviewed last month to reduce the size of the windows. The HDC asked for additional context information. None has been received.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on no exception warranted to ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Window Replacement***, Ms. Ervin made a MOTION to DENY the application. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 8/1 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, NORVELL, RISTAINO,
WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: GEORGE

DECISION: WINDOW REPLACEMENT DENIED.

- The date of the HDC Retreat has been cancelled. It will be rescheduled for another time very soon.
- Mr. Watkins is resigning. The Wilmore neighborhood is endorsing a person to the Mayor.
- The State CLG Coordinator will come to our retreat and satisfy the meeting requirement.
- Mr. Tom Low has been appointed to the HDC from the Planning Commission. He will attend beginning in December.

With business complete the HDC adjourned at 10:00 pm with a meeting length of six hours and 52 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission

DRAFT