



Approved March 9, 2011

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

February 9, 2011

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Roger Dahnert
Mr. Don Duffy
Mr. Tom Egan
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair
Ms. Debra Glennon, Second Vice Chair
Mr. Greg Grueneich
Ms. Barbara Highfill
Ms. Meg Nealon
Ms. Paula Owens
Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair
Ms. Karen Rush
Mr. Curtis Watkins

MEMBERS ABSENT: NONE

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Rogers, Administrator

Historic District Commission

Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the

Historic District Commission

Ms. Terrie Hagler-Gray

Senior Assistant City Attorney

Mr. Thomas Powers

Assistant City Attorney

Ms. George called the regular February meeting of the Historic District Commission meeting to order at 3:04 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those

Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Index of Addresses:	811 East Tremont Avenue	Dilworth
	1821 Dilworth Road East	Dilworth
	2218 Charlotte Drive	Dilworth

Ms. Glennon declared a conflict of interest as an Adjacent Property Owner and removed herself from the Commission for the first application.

Application: 811 East Tremont Avenue – Rear Addition.

This application is for a cross gable rear addition and was deferred for some plan clarification and a few changes. An existing rear addition will be removed and replaced with a two story rear facing gable which ties back to the ridge of the new cross gable. On the right elevation, revised plans show a window centered in the gable, heavy shingled brackets to “hold” the bay, and more steepness to the rear facing gable. On the left elevation, windows have been aligned. Vertical battens have been eliminated from the rear gable.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition with shingles on the new rear facing dormer, gable termination on right elevation just like drawn on the left, details to match existing. Mr. Watkins seconded.

VOTE: 11/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, NEALON, OWENS, RISTAINO, RUSH, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED WITH CHANGES.

Application: 1821 Dilworth Road East – Lift House and Add Front Porch.

This c. 1940 house is at the corner of Dilworth Road East and Worthington Avenue. It is a 1 and ½ story painted brick house that sits very close to the ground. The plan is to lift the house, add a front porch – in place of the existing stoop, create a basement with rear loaded garage, and add a side stoop. The front porch is to be 9-14' in depth.

Applicant Comments: Owner Chip Weatherly explained that the house has flooding problems. Lifting it will address the water issue but the main reason take this on is to create a basement workshop with a drive out garage. A large tree

was harmed in the past when a large oil tank was removed and now may be the time to take it out.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on appropriateness of undertaking, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the LIFTING of the house and the extension (or rebuilding) of the foundation. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 12/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, NEALON, OWENS, RISTAINO, RUSH, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

MOTION: Based on the need for additional drawings and final plan decisions, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to defer final revised plans which will show (1) porch roof resolution, (2) windows, (3) porch rail, (4) columns, (5) door changes, (6) garage door, and (7) documentation regarding large tree – if its condition and health require that it be removed – provide documentation, if it is to remain – provide protection documentation. Mr. Grueneich seconded.

VOTE: 11/1 AYES: DAHNERT, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, NEALON, OWENS, RISTAINO, RUSH, WATKINS

NAYS: DUFFY

DECISION: LIFTING MAY PROCEED BUT FINAL PLANS WILL BE RESUBMITTED FOR COMMISSION REVIEW.

Application: 2218 Charlotte Drive – Addition.

This house is on the last street of the Dilworth Local Historic District. It is painted brick with original Tudor detailing. The plan is to raise the roof plane and create a new rear facing gable which ties back to the new roof ridge. A right elevation secondary gable will tuck into lines of primary gable. On the left a box bay will break the mass. An interesting detail exists of cross shaped voids on the front. This detail will be copied in reverse (solid cross of brick projecting) on the side. The foot print will expand by about nine feet to the rear.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 12/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, NEALON, OWENS, RISTAINO, RUSH, WATKINS

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED.

- Language for the term “match” will be researched by Mr. Rogers and brought to full Commission for approval to include in the ***Policy & Design Guidelines***.
- Ms. Highfill reported that a reception at the Grier Rae house on Providence Road will be a great opportunity to see firsthand the art of the father/son restorers’ work. It will be on February 19.
- Mr. Rogers reported that two neighborhoods are knocking at the door for inclusion into the Local Historic District Program. They are Cherry and the Belmont neighborhoods.

The minutes were unanimously approved with one name change (Ms. George was said when it should have been Ms. Glennon in one instance.) The usual direction applied that any changes or correction be reported to Ms. Birmingham.

With business complete the meeting adjourned at 5: 24 pm for a length of 2 hours and 20 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission